

**SUBURBAN MOBILITY AUTHORITY FOR REGIONAL
TRANSPORTATION
BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING**

APPROVED MINUTES – September 27, 2018

A regular meeting of the Board of Directors of the Suburban Mobility Authority for Regional Transportation (SMART) was held on Thursday, September 27, 2018 at 2:00 PM. The meeting was held at the Buhl Building, 535 Griswold, Suite 600, Detroit, MI 48226.

ATTENDANCE

SMART Board of Directors:

Chairman	Mr. Abdul Haidous
Vice-Chairman	Mr. John Paul Rea
	Mr. Robert Daddow
	Mr. Royce Maniko
	Mr. Gerald Poisson
	Mr. Khalil Rahal
	Ms. Melissa Roy

SMART Back-up Board Secretary: Mr. Dustin Hagfors

SMART General Manager: Mr. John Hertel

SMART Staff Present:

- Mr. Ronald Beier
- Mr. Robert Cramer
- Mr. Steve Dobbins
- Ms. Beth Gibbons
- Ms. Jennifer Harding
- Mr. Ian Holme
- Ms. Lynette Hurt
- Ms. Carol Jones
- Mr. David Sabuda
- Ms. Kirsten Silwanowicz
- Ms. Leeya Sutter
- Mr. Darrell Taylor
- Mr. Keith Taylor
- Ms. Malindia Westbrook

Public Registered:

Passenger	Ms. Deirdre Bowen
Passenger	Mr. Eugene Conway
Passenger	Ms. Patty Fedewa
Passenger (Clarkston)	Ms. Toni Johnson-Smith
Passenger (Detroit)	Mr. Amiel Baldwin
Passenger (Detroit)	Ms. Margaret Henderson

Passenger (Farmington)	Mr. Mike Lewis
Passenger (Farmington Hills)	Ms. Reba Hogan
Passenger (Royal Oak)	Mr. Clark Campbell
Passenger (Southfield)	Ms. Carolyn Robbins
Passenger (West Bloomfield)	Mr. Dennis Boren
Passenger (West Bloomfield)	Ms. Pamela Gilliam
Passenger (West Bloomfield)	Ms. Christine Jordan
Passenger (West Bloomfield)	Mr. Terrance Jordan
Motor City Freedom Riders	Mr. Joel Batterman
Detroit People's Platform	Mr. Derek Hollaway
Transit Riders United	Ms. Megan Owens
Joey's Towing	Ms. Renee Patterson
DAC	Mr. Roland Tindle

1. Call to Order

Chairman Abdul Haidous called the meeting to order at 2:10 PM.

A) Pledge of Allegiance

2. Roll Call

Present: Chairman Abdul Haidous, Vice-Chairman John Paul Rea, Mr. Robert Daddow, Mr. Gerald Poisson, Ms. Melissa Roy, Mr. Royce Maniko, and Mr. Kahlil Rahal

Absent: None

A quorum was present.

3. Adoption of Agenda

Mr. John Paul Rea requested that an agenda item be added under New Business (Item E) with regards to the millage recount in Macomb County.

MOTION: Moved by Ms. Melissa Roy, seconded by Mr. Khalil Rahal, to approve the Agenda for September 27, 2018 meeting.

DISCUSSION

None

VOTE: THE MOTION CARRIED.

4. Certification of Public Notice

The Secretary read the Public Notice into the record.

5. Minutes

A. Board Meeting Minutes for August 23, 2018

MOTION: Moved by Mr. John Paul Rea, seconded by Mr. Robert Daddow, to approve the meeting minutes for August 23, 2018.

DISCUSSION:

None

VOTE: THE MOTION CARRIED.

6. Public Participation

Chairman Abdul Haidous declared the meeting open for Public Participation.

DISCUSSION:

- Mr. Amiel Baldwin, Passenger (Detroit)
- Ms. Pamela Gilliam, Passenger (West Bloomfield)
- Ms. Reba Hogan, Passenger (Farmington Hills)
- Mr. Dennis Boren, Passenger (West Bloomfield)
- Ms. Toni Johnson-Smith, Passenger (Clarkston)
- Ms. Carolyn Robbins, Passenger (Southfield)
- Ms. Christine Jordan, Passenger (West Bloomfield)
- Ms. Margaret Henderson, Passenger (Detroit)

Multiple riders of the Route 851 voiced concerns over the reliability of the bus route. Buses are not showing up and resulting in riders needing to utilize other forms of transportation to get to/from work. Riders are also concerned about bus cleanliness, malfunctioning air conditioning, leaking roof hatch, and inaccuracy of bus tracking app.

- Mr. Mike Lewis, Passenger (Farmington)

Mr. Lewis voiced his concerns about the bus schedules not properly reflecting traffic in the area resulting in buses showing up late and customers being left out in the elements. He also warned about the risks of community budget shortfalls and the potential to move money from one source, such as public transportation, to cover other community expenses.

- Mr. Derek Hollaway, Detroit People’s Platform
Mr. Hollaway had questions concerning the proposed fare changes by DDOT and SMART and wondered when a vote would be occurring to approve those changes.
- Mr. Clark Campbell, Passenger (Royal Oak)
Mr. Campbell had concerns about roof hatches leaking on the new FAST buses and the unreliability of the bus tracker app. He stated that the app can be confusing and suggests contracting out for a new app in the future.
- Ms. Megan Owens, Transit Riders United
Ms. Owens acknowledged the concerns brought up by the previous speakers and inquired if SMART can share information regarding on-time performance with riders. She also requested better communication concerning changes in service be shared with riders so they can adjust their commute accordingly.
- Mr. Joel Batterman, Motor City Freedom Riders
Mr. Batterman suggested some improvements to the FAST service such as station upgrades and adding triple capacity bike racks to the buses to accommodate for more biking passengers. He also inquired about SMART’s long-range plan concerning changes to the system.
- Mr. Eugene Conway, Passenger
Mr. Conway informed the Board that there is no bus stop sign located at the new McNamara Terminal stop.

7. Chairman’s Report

DISCUSSION:

None

8. General Manager’s Report

DISCUSSION:

Mr. Hertel wanted the riders that spoke to know that their concerns do mean a lot to him and the Board. He feels that Route 851 is becoming “the Titanic” and concerns will be addressed immediately to correct those issues. Mr. Hertel discussed that the millage recently passed is the second lowest millage of any millage in the State of Michigan for a transit agency. This limited funding combined with a service area larger than any other transit agency makes operations more difficult.

Mr. Hertel was happy to report that by December, the last order of new buses promised from the previous millage will be delivered and that will have a positive impact on riders, especially those on Route 851. The long wait was due to there only being one large bus manufacturer in the United States, GILLIG, but the patience will eventually pay off.

There is a constant effort to try to maintain a fleet of buses to cover all of the service area and efforts will be ramped up to take care of the issue of dirty buses with leaking roof hatches. Mr. Hertel asked anyone who sees another dirty bus to call him directly at his office at (313) 223-2115 so that he can address the issue immediately.

Mr. Hertel also reported on the following:

- FAST Ridership for August showed a continued growth in ridership with the increase in average weekly ridership growing four months in a row to a new high of 38.3% month-over-month increase. FAST ridership has boosted system-wide weekly ridership to 10.6%.
- SMART made a presentation to Novi City Council and subsequently met with City Staff to present an initial service proposal, which was well received.
- SMART has officially started their Comprehensive Operations Analysis (COA) that will look in-depth at the entire fixed route system through rider surveys, data analysis, public workshops, and route planning. The effort will have a dedicated website and officially be branded SMART PATH.
- The next round of 40 new fixed route buses will start arriving at SMART from GILLIG starting mid-October. The buses will all be in service by mid-December 2018.
- SMART is finishing the annual independent financial audit.

Human Resources

- Contract negotiations with each of SMART's unions have begun

Retirements in September, 2018:

- 1 Fixed Route Operator, 1 Connector Operator, 1 Central Radio Dispatcher, and 1 Data Payroll Technician will retire in September, 2018

Filled Positions:

- 4 Coach Service & Shelter Attendants
- 1 Requisition Specialist in Purchasing
- 1 Central Radio Dispatcher
- 1 Revenue Accountant

A. Resolution: Approval by SMART Board of the Chairperson's Audit Committee Appointments

MOTION: Moved by Mr. John Paul Rea, seconded by Mr. Gerald Poisson, that the Board of Directors of the Suburban Mobility Authority for Regional Transportation

hereby approves the appointment of Mr. John Paul Rea, Mr. Royce Maniko, and Mr. Robert Daddow to the Audit Committee for the 2018/2019 term.

DISCUSSION:

The Board requested an Audit Committee meeting be scheduled for Thursday, October 25 at 1:00 PM.

VOTE: Board members in attendance voted in the affirmative. **THE MOTION CARRIED.**

B. Resolution: Authorization to Award a Contract for SMART Oil Change Pit Improvements for Wayne, Oakland, and Macomb Terminals

MOTION: Moved by Ms. Melissa Roy, seconded by Mr. John Paul Rea, that the Board authorizes the General Manager to award a contract for oil change pit improvements for Wayne, Oakland, and Macomb Terminals to Marshall Contracting Services. The amount of the contract is \$644,134.00 with funds spent by June 30, 2019.

DISCUSSION:

Ms. Roy had concerns about the low number of responses to the contract bid and believes that some innovative ideas can be used to improve public relations and get some new companies working with SMART in the future.

VOTE: Board members in attendance voted in the affirmative. **THE MOTION CARRIED.**

C. Resolution: Authorization to Award a Contract to Purchase Microsoft SQL Server Licenses

MOTION: Moved by Mr. John Paul Rea, seconded by Mr. Gerald Poisson, that the Board authorizes the General Manager to award a contract for the purchase of Microsoft Standard Query Language (SQL) Server licenses for a total cost of \$57,246.00.

DISCUSSION:

Mr. Abdul Haidous questioned whether this purchase would eliminate the concerns riders had with the bus tracker app. Mr. Robert Cramer stated the purchase will help with regards to data being shared with Transit App as well as helping with tracking the buses.

VOTE: Board members in attendance voted in the affirmative. **THE MOTION CARRIED.**

D. Resolution: Authorization to Award a One-Year Contract for Towing Services

MOTION: Moved by Mr. Royce Maniko, initially seconded by Mr. Gerald Poisson but later retracted, that the Board authorizes the General Manager to award contracts to Boulevard & Trumbull Towing, Inc. and B&G Towing, LLC for towing services for the entire service area of Macomb, Oakland, and Wayne counties. The one year contract for the primary vendor is estimated to be \$235,000.00 and the total one year contract for the secondary vendor is estimated to be \$16,000.00. The total annual amount for one year of towing services is estimated to be \$251,000.00.

DISCUSSION:

Mr. Poisson had questions about the status of licenses with the state upon the time of receiving bids as well as if there was a termination clause in place depending on the outcome of court findings of current litigation facing one of the contracted companies. Mr. Robert Cramer confirmed that there were no license concerns at the time of bid letting and language in the contract has been updated to address legal concerns. Mr. Khalil Rahal had concerns about the timeline for requesting bids and whether smaller companies were contacted. Mr. Cramer and Ms. Malindia Westbrook, SMART Manager of Procurement, ensured that standard procedures were followed and mainly larger towing companies respond to posting due to having the equipment and staff to accommodate SMART's towing needs. Due to the limited number of responses, Mr. Rahal stated that he could not support this motion. Ms. Melissa Roy also had concerns about the limited number of responses and asked that the request for proposal (RFP) process be reviewed for the future. After the additional questions, Mr. Poisson retracted his support for the motion.

VOTE: Due to no secondary support for the motion, there cannot be a vote. **THE MOTION FAILS.**

E. Resolution: Authorization to Pay Invoice for Election Related Expenses

MOTION: Moved by Mr. John Paul Rea, seconded by Ms. Melissa Roy, that the Board adopt the resolution authorizing the General Manager to pay the Macomb County invoice for election expenses and amend the budget to reflect this expense. This will authorize the budget to be amended to increase the Finance Department budget and decrease the contingency line, each by \$16,275.11.

DISCUSSION:

Mr. Gerald Poisson did not mind if the amount came from the tax proceeds, but he would like to see the SMART Legal Counsel's opinion why this was an allowable SMART cost as opposed to an allowable cost to Macomb County who questioned the

vote and levied it. He believes that this payment may arguably be a gift under the Michigan Constitution, but he is supportive of the motion. Ms. Roy believes that the transit opposition is well funded and SMART needs to establish a relationship with groups in Macomb County who will help support transit in the future. Mr. Abdul Haidous feels that SMART was well promoted in Oakland County and Wayne County. In the future, he would like to see that same level of promotion in Macomb County.

VOTE: Board members in attendance voted in the affirmative. **THE MOTION CARRIED.**

9. Board Member Business

DISCUSSION:

Mr. John Hertel informed the Board that SMART received a 45th Anniversary Award for serving the public from the Michigan Public Transit Authority. He also congratulated Mr. Abdul Haidous on his unanimous election to represent Wayne County on the Airport Authority Board of Commissioners. Mr. Gerald Poisson stated that this meeting was the first time since he was elected to the Board in 1999 that he has seen such a large group of riders who support transit come in to voice their concerns with the Board. He requests that the Board start to receive a summary of complaints monthly to address items in the future. Due to the movement nationally that is anti-transit, he believes SMART needs to do their best and look to make improvements sooner than later. Mr. Royce Maniko shared a news article concerning House Bill 4184, passed by the Michigan House and moving to the Senate, which restricts phone in voting for members of an elected public body. Mr. John Paul Rea stated that there have been some questions in Macomb County in regards to services provided to the disabled community and ongoing discussions have helped answer some of those concerns as they arise. Mr. Robert Cramer requested that the Nominating Committee report on their recommendations. Mr. Robert Daddow announced that the Nominating Committee recommended Mr. Rea as Chairman and Mr. Daddow as Vice Chairman.

Adjournment

There being no further business to come before the Board, upon motion made by Mr. John Paul Rea, seconded by Mr. Gerald Poisson, and unanimously carried, the meeting adjourned at 3:45 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Dustin Hagfors
Back-up Secretary to the Board of Directors

